Containment ring problem (Impeller burst) IWB Case study

By Alla Zusman, Ideation International Inc.

<u>azusman@ideationtriz.com</u>

©2000, Ideation International Inc.

Editor's note: This paper shows the application of the Ideation Workbench Method to the case that was presented in the September 2000, issue of the TRIZ Journal.

Innovation Situation Questionnaire

1. Brief description of the problem

The engineered system, which is designed to contain the fragments resulting from an impeller burst of a maximum-speed fan, consists of the following: a fan, fan shroud (which controls the direction of the air stream), and an armor-steel containment ring. The problem to be solved is that the ring is too heavy and must be reduced in weight by 50%.

2. Information about the system

2.1 System name

The following systemic levels might be considered:

- Containment ring
- Fan
- Air conditioning system
- Aircraft
- Testing of ring

For the ring, the problem is as follows: the ring must be strong to withstand the impact of the impeller fragments, and the ring should not be heavy.

For the fan, the problem is as follows: the impeller can burst, but fragments should not fly away.

For the air-conditioning system, the problem is as follows: the impeller can be broken, but the air should be conditioned.

For the aircraft, the problem is as follows: the impeller can burst, but neither people nor equipment should be harmed.

For testing the ring, the problem is as follows: the ring's ability to capture flying fragments should be tested, but it is difficult to move the heavy ring back and forth.

<u>Idea # 1</u>

Make the ring as an assembly made of light-weight parts that are easy to move for testing purposes.

We can influence two systemic levels: the ring and the fan assembly. Let's select the fan assembly as the system to be considered.

2.2 System structure

The fan assembly consists of the following elements:

- fan
- motor
- shaft
- motor support
- containment ring
- connectors or support to keep the ring

2.3 Functioning of the system

The primary useful function of the fan is to supply (move) air for the air conditioning system.

The fan rotates quickly and moves air. The air is conditioned so that the aircraft cabin can be supplied with conditioned air.

2.4 System environment

Other parts of the air conditioning system:

- pipes
- heat exchanger
- airflow distributors

Other systems located nearby:

- aircraft covering
- equipment

Other system interacting with the fan and air conditioning system:

- electrical power supply
- air supply
- exhaust air removal
- vibration dampers

Conditions around the system: indoor conditions

3. Information about the problem situation *3.1 Problem that should be resolved*

Reduce the weight of the ring by 50%.

The primary harmful function of the given system (the fan assembly) is that impeller fragments fly away if the impeller bursts.

3.2 Mechanism causing the problem

The containment ring must be strong to contain the flying fragments – for this reason the ring is thick and, as a result, heavy.

The cause of an impeller burst is as follows: Rotation of the fan results in centrifugal forces that "pull" the parts of the impeller. The strength of the impeller material can be compromised by material defects and fatigue. As a result, the impeller can burst, causing the impeller fragments to fly off. Due to the high speed at which the fan rotates, the flying fragments carry high energy and can harm people and other parts of the aircraft.

2.3 Undesired consequences of unresolved problem

The high weight of the ring makes it difficult to carry out the routine tests required by the FAA.

The "dead weight" of the aircraft equipment is also high.

If the weight problem is resolved at the expense of the ring's strength, the result will be inadequate protection from the flying impeller fragments, which in turn can result in death and/or damage.

2.4 History of the problem

The increased requirements for conditioning the air are met using a higher velocity airflow, but this means that the rotational speed of the fan increases. As a result, an impeller burst becomes more probable and the danger from the flying fragments increases. Because the energy of the flying fragments is increased, the ring must be stronger. As a result, the ring is heavier.

Known attempts to reduce the ring thickness resulted in a reduction in strength.

Idea # 2

Provide high airflow with low rotational speed of the fan. Perhaps utilize several slow fans instead of one that rotates quickly

2.5 Other systems in which a similar problem exists

Similar problems exist in many other areas where weight and mechanical strength are critical issues, as well as other systems for protection against flying parts. We do not have any information about how these problems have been addressed.

2.6 Other problems to be solved

Use an alternative method to contain the fragments.

Make the impeller unbreakable.

Others (see the problems on different systemic levels in the beginning of the ISQ).

3. Ideal vision of solution

No containment ring is necessary. An impeller burst is no longer possible.

4. Available resources

Substance resources

- Material of containment ring
- Material of fan impeller
- Other objects around
- Airflow

Field resources

- Mechanical forces
- Airflow energy
- Electrical energy
- Magnetic field (motor)

Space resources

- Space inside the ring
- Space outside the ring

Time resources

- Time during which the fan is not operating
- Time when the fan is operating
- Time before the impeller bursts
- Time after the impeller bursts

Informational resources: No special resources

Functional resources

• Rotation

5. Allowable changes to the system

- Drastic changes are allowed.
- Any reduction in strength is unacceptable.

6. Criteria for selecting solution concepts

- Weight reduction of at least 30%
- Cost increase of no more than 5%
- About two weeks for new design
- One year for implementation

7. Description of the company business environment

(Withheld)

8. Project data

(Withheld)

Problem Formulation

The Diagram



Basic Directions for Innovations:

Problem statement	Prio- rity code	Direction	Preliminary ideas
1. Find a way to eliminate, reduce, or	1	Reduce	

prevent [the] (Ring is heavy) under the		weight or	
conditions of [the] (Ring is thick).		density	
		Change the	
		structure	
2. Find an alternative way to obtain [the]	1	Reduce	
(Ring is thick) that offers the following:		weight or	
provides or enhances [the] (High		density	
mechanical strength), does not cause [the]		Change the	
(Ring is heavy).		structure	
3. Try to resolve the following	1	Resolve	
contradiction: The useful factor [the] (Ring		contradiction	
is thick) should be in place in order to		related to the	
provide or enhance [the] (High mechanical		ring	
strength), and should not exist in order to		thickness	
avoid [the] (Ring is heavy).			
4. Find an alternative way to obtain [the]	1	Improve	
(High mechanical strength) that offers the		mechanical	
following: provides or enhances [the]		strength	
(Containing fragments), does not require			
[the] (Ring is thick).			
5. Find an alternative way to obtain [the]	2	Contain	Idea # 3: Utilize a
(Containing fragments) that offers the		fragments	"weak" ring that
following: eliminates, reduces, or prevents		with the	will absorb energy
[the] (Fragments flying away), does not		weak ring	as it is destroyed
require [the] (High mechanical strength).			
6. Find a way to eliminate, reduce, or	2	Stop	
prevent [the] (Fragments flying away) in		fragments	
order to avoid [the] (Damage to the		from flying	
aircraft), under the conditions of [the]			
(Impeller burst).			
7. Find a way to eliminate, reduce, or	3	Prevent the	
prevent [the] (Impeller burst) in order to		burst	
avoid [the] (Fragments flying away), under			
the conditions of [the] (Centrifugal forces			
pull parts of impeller) and (Impeller's			
material is not strong enough).			
8. Find a way to eliminate, reduce, or	3	Counteract	
prevent [the] (Centrifugal forces pull parts		centrifugal	
of impeller) in order to avoid [the]		forces	
(Impeller burst), under the conditions of			
[the] (Fan rotates quickly).			
9. Find an alternative way to obtain [the]	Out of	Alternative	
(Fan rotates quickly) that offers the	scope	fan rotation	
following: provides or enhances [the] (Fan			
moves air), does not cause [the]			
(Centrifugal forces pull parts of impeller)			

and (High energy of fragments).			
10. Try to resolve the following	Out of	Resolve	
contradiction: The useful factor [the] (Fan	scope	contradiction	
rotates quickly) should be in place in order	1	related to the	
to provide or enhance [the] (Fan moves		speed of fan	
air), and should not exist in order to avoid		rotation	
[the] (Centrifugal forces pull parts of			
impeller) and (High energy of fragments).			
11 Consider transitioning to the next	Out of		
generation of the system that will provide	scope		
[the] (Fan moves air) in a more effective	J. Opt		
way and/or will be free of existing			
problems			
12 Find an alternative way to obtain [the]	Out of	Move air	
(Fan moves air) that does not require [the]	scope	without	
(Fan rotates quickly)	scope	rotation	
13 Find a way to eliminate reduce or	Out of	Protect	
prevent [the] (Damage to the aircraft) under	scone	aircraft from	
the conditions of [the] (Fragments flying	scope	fragments	
away) and (High energy of fragments)		naginents	
14 Consider transitioning to the payt	Out of		
generation of the system that will provide	Scono		
[tha] (Tast convenience) in a more effective	scope		
way and/or will be free of existing			
problems			
15 Find on alternative way to abtain [the]	1	Improve tost	Idaa # 1: Darfarm
(Test convenience) that is not influenced by	1		tosting without
[the] (Ding is heavy)		convenience	removing the ring
[[the] (King is neavy).	1	Deduce	Idea # 5. Deduce
16. Find a way to eliminate, reduce, or	1	Reduce	Idea $\#$ 5: Keduce
prevent [the] (High energy of fragments) in		energy of	the mass of the
order to avoid [the] (Damage to the		tragments	tragments to
aircraft), under the conditions of [the] (Fan			reduce damage
rotates quickly).		~	
17. Find a way to eliminate, reduce, or	3	Screen	
prevent [the] (Material defects) in order to		material	
avoid [the] (Impeller's material is not			
strong enough).			
18. Find a way to eliminate, reduce, or	3	Improve	
prevent [the] (Impeller's material is not		strength of	
strong enough) in order to avoid [the]		impeller	
(Impeller burst), under the conditions of			
[the] (Material defects).			

Prioritize Directions and Generate Preliminary Ideas

The following preliminary ideas have been resulted from the direct analysis of the basic Directions:

- 3. Utilize a "weak" ring that will absorb energy as it is destroyed
- 4. Perform testing without removing the ring
- 5. Reduce the mass of the fragments to reduce damage

Directions selected for further considerations

Selected Basic Directions	Selected Refined Directions
	or Undesired factor
1. Find a way to eliminate, reduce, or prevent [the] (Ring	Reduce weight
is heavy) under the conditions of [the] (Ring is thick).	
4. Find an alternative way to obtain [the] (High	4.1. Improve the useful factor
mechanical strength) that offers the following: provides	(High mechanical strength).
or enhances [the] (Containing fragments), does not	
require [the] (Ring is thick).	
3. Try to resolve the following contradiction: The useful	3.1. Apply separation
factor [the] (Ring is thick) should be in place in order to	principles to satisfy
provide or enhance [the] (High mechanical strength), and	contradictory requirements
should not exist in order to avoid [the] (Ring is heavy).	related to [the] (Ring is thick).
5. Find an alternative way to obtain [the] (Containing	5.3. Increase effectiveness of
fragments) that offers the following: eliminates, reduces,	the useful action of [the]
or prevents [the] (Fragments flying away), does not	(Containing fragments).
require [the] (High mechanical strength).	
7. Find a way to eliminate, reduce, or prevent [the]	Protect from fire or explosion
(Impeller burst) in order to avoid [the] (Fragments flying	
away), under the conditions of [the] (Centrifugal forces	Reduce deformation
pull parts of impeller) and (Impeller's material is not	displacement shock vibration
strong enough).	or destruction
15. Find an alternative way to obtain [the] (Test	15.1. Improve the useful
convenience) that is not influenced by [the] (Ring is	factor (Test convenience).
heavy).	

Direction1: Reduce weight



Operator: Abandon symmetry



Idea # 6

Vary the thickness of the ring tube. Reduce the thickness where permissible.

Operator: Reduce the weight of individual parts



<u>Idea # 5a</u>

Reduce the energy of fragments by reducing their weight (i.e. help the impeller break into smaller pieces). That will allow the ring to be made less strong and thus lighter.

Operator: Strengthen individual parts

💡 Untitled-Innovation WorkBench	
<u>F</u> ile <u>E</u> dit F <u>o</u> rmat <u>V</u> iew <u>T</u> ools <u>D</u> iagram <u>W</u> indow <u>H</u> elp	
🗅 😅 🖬 🚭 👗 🖻 🕄 🐂 📾 🖤 📄 🚍 🐺 🐺 🚝 🕼 🚝 📿 📿 🥥	🕨 🔿 🖤 🚺 100% 🔽 Containment Ring
Prioritize Directions	Strengthen individual parts
1. Directions selected for further	Consider strengthening those parts that bear the main load,
consideration	load.
» 1. Find a way to eliminate, reduce, or prevent [the] (Ring	
is heavy) under the conditions of [the] (Ring is thick).	Illustrations:
 I. Isolate the system or its part from the harmful effect of [the] (Ring is heavy). 	■ <u>Funp housing made of standard proe</u> ★ <u>Tire design</u>
1.2. Counteract the harmful effect of [the] (Ring is heavy).	For this purpose, use: I <u>Substance modification</u>
1.3. Impact on the harmful action of [the] (Ring is heavy).	
1.4. Reduce sensitivity of the system or its part to the harmful effect of [the] (Ring is heavy).	
1.5. Eliminate the cause of the undesired action of [the] (Ring is heavy).	
1.6. Reduce the harmful results produced by [the] (Ring is heavy).	
1.7. Apply universal Operators to reduce the undesired factor (Ring is heavy).	

Auxiliary Operator: Substance modification

<mark>9 Untitled-Innovation WorkBench</mark> File Edit Format View Tools <u>D</u> iagram Window <u>H</u> elp		I. WXUQWAQ	×
D 2 日 4 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1			
Prioritize Directions		Substance modification	
1. Directions selected for further		There are literally hundreds of ways to modify a substance (material). These changes can be classified by the character of the	
consideration		transforming influence (e.g., heating until melting) or by the result	
» 1. Find a way to eliminate, reduce, or prevent [the] (Ring		(e.g., change in mechanical or magnetic properties). This section	
is heavy) under the conditions of [the] (Ring is thick).		contains "transformation" Operators of both of the above types,	
1.1. Isolate the system or its part from the harmful effect o [the] (Ring is heavy).	f	obvious (innovative) results.	
1.2. Counteract the harmful effect of [the] (Ring is heavy)		To modify a substance, consider the following recommendations (Operators):	
1.3. Impact on the harmful action of [the] (Ring is heavy).		Generate mechanical stress	
 1.4. Reduce sensitivity of the system or its part to the harmful effect of [the] (Ring is heavy). 		Alloy materials	
1.5. Eliminate the cause of the undesired action of [the] (Ring is heavy).		See also: Introduce additives	
1.6. Reduce the harmful results produced by [the] (Ring is heavy).	;		
1.7. Apply universal Operators to reduce the undesired			

Auxiliary Operator: Generate mechanical stress



<u>Idea # 7</u>

Generate mechanical stress. For example, use additional rings which have been pressurefitted to create a force directed toward the inside the ring.

Auxiliary Operator: Heat treatment

Idea # 8

Use thermal treatment to harden the ring material.

Auxiliary Operator: Introduce additives

Idea # 9

Use of special threads, such as in bullet protection vests.

Operator: Apply inflatable constructions

양 Untitled-Innovation WorkBench File Edit Format View Tools Diagram Window Help		
🗅 🖆 🖬 🎒 🙏 🛍 🛍 🏹 📄 吉 吉 信 信 信 🗄 🚿 🖋 👰 🐺	← → ♥ ♥ 100% ▼ Containment Ring	
Prioritize Directions	Apply inflatable constructions	
1. Directions selected for further	Consider applying pneumatic (inflatable) constructions instead of mechanical ones.	
consideration * 1. Find a way to eliminate, reduce, or prevent [the] (Ring is heavy) under the conditions of [the] (Ring is thick). 1.1. Isolate the system or its part from the harmful effect of Automobile air bags Comparing the system or its part from the harmful effect of automobile air bags An automobile driver involved in an accident experiences inertia upon impact, causing him to collide with the car. Although seat belts reduce this risk, they are often uncomfortable. A safety feature which avoids these problems is the air bag. This system, which is activated by the impact of the automobile, inflates in an instant.	 Illustrations: Adjusting roof height Automobile air bags Cleaning a cylindrical reservoir Hatchway roof design Immobilizing a cow Immobilizing a cow Inflatable excavator Inflatable excavator Inflatable excavator Securing loads with inflatable material Treating workpieces with sandpaper Using inflated construction forms Modular inflatable furniture Relieving high-altitude illness In particular, create these constructions by applying elastic tanks that are inflated with excessive pressure or normal atmospheric pressure (provided that lower ambient pressure is present). Illustrations: Filling empty space with balloons Titling with air bags Y Vacuum clip 	

<u>Idea # 10</u>

Replace the ring with the airbag inflated by the impeller burst.

Direction 4.1: Improve the useful factor (Mechanical strength)

Q Untitled-Innovation WorkBench				
Eile Edit Format View Iools Diagram Window Help				
🗅 😂 🖬 🚭 👗 ங 🛍 🏹 🔜 🎟 停 停 扫 >> 🗲 🔍 🚳 🧶 📿	🔿 🔮 🖤 100% 🔽 Containment Ring			
Prioritize Directions	Improve mechanical strength			
1. Directions selected for further	Consider the following recommendations (Operators) for improving the mechanical strength of a product:			
consideration	Transform the shape of an object			
» 1. Find a way to eliminate, reduce, or prevent [the] (Ring	Transform an object's micro-structure			
is heavy) under the conditions of [the] (Ring is thick).	Transform the aggregate state			
v 4. Tind on ellementics way to altheir films? () lists another is al	Integration into a poly-system			
» 4. Find an alternative way to obtain [the] (Fight freehalical strength) that offers the following: provides or enhances [the]	Anti-loading			
(Containing fragments), does not require [the] (Ring is	Introduce a strengthening additive			
thick).				
	See also:			
4.1. Improve the useful factor (High mechanical strength).	Eliminate a stressful operation			
4.2. Obtain the useful result without the use of [the] (High mechanical strength).				
4.3. Increase effectiveness of the useful action of [the] (High mechanical strength).				
4.4. Synthesize the new system to provide [the] (High mechanical strength).				
4.5. Apply universal Operators to provide the useful factor (High mechanical strength).				
4.6. Consider resources to provide the useful factor (High mechanical strength).				

Operator: Transform the shape of the object

<u>Idea # 11</u>

Make a thin ring, which has reinforcing ribs. If the ribs are placed on the internal surface of the ring, flying fragments will lose a large amount of their energy smashing into the ribs.

Idea # 12

Make the ring corrugated in two planes.

Auxiliary Operator: Create a shape conforming to expected wear

<u>Idea # 13</u>

Find where the rings usually break and reinforce these places.

Auxiliary Operator: Preliminary anti-action

Idea # 14

Internal ribs with sharp edges can counteract flying fragments breaking them into smaller pieces.

Operator: Transform an object's micro-structure

Auxiliary Operator: Modify part of a substance

See idea # 8.

Auxiliary Operator: Substitute for a part of substance

<u>Idea # 15</u>

Use a multi-layer ring: additional strengthening rings, rings having different hardness and elasticity, rings which have a gap in-between them, filling the gap with energy-absorbing material.

<u>Idea # 16</u>

Make the ring out of separate layers so cracks, which develop inside, won't spread.

Operator: Integration into a poly-system

		• _ w × • & • \$	3
🗅 🖆 🖬 🎒 🙏 ங 💼 🏹 📄 🚝 🌾 🎼 🌐 🚝 🐺 🐺 📿 📿 🍕	-	🔸 🗣 🖤 100% 🔽 Containment Ring	ī
Prioritize Directions		Integrate into a poly-system	l
1. Directions selected for further consideration » 1. Find a way to eliminate, reduce, or prevent [the] (Ring is heavy) under the conditions of [the] (Ring is thick).		To increase the resistance of an object to deformation, consider integrating it with other similar objects to form a single high-strength system.	
		Illustrations:	
😭 Transporting window glass	×	✿ Bonding glass plates for grinding ✿ Transporting window glass	
Transporting window glass			
While being transported, sheets of window glass are separated by paper, protected by chips and packed into wooden cases. But even with these precautions, breakage often occurs.		For this purpose, use: I <u>Homogeneous poly-system</u>	
In order to reduce breakage, window glass can be transported as a solid block rather than in separate sheets. Each glass sheet is covered with a thin film of oil, and the sheets are then joined together to form a block, which			
Is much stronger than an individual sheet. Tests showed that when dropped from a height of two meters, the glass block sustained little damage; in contrast, more than 50% of the glass packed in the usual way was broken.			

See idea # 15

Operator: Introduce a strengthening element

<u>Idea # 17</u>

Use metal concrete or other composite materials

Operator: Anti-loading

Auxiliary Operator: Use pre-stressed constructions

<u>Idea # 18</u>

Create inner stresses inside the ring: This can be done, for example, using wiring, banding, double ring structure, etc.

Direction 3.1: Apply separation principles to satisfy contradictory requirements related to [the] (Ring is thick)

S Case study-Innovation WorkBench			
□ 2			
Prioritize Directions	Separation		
1. Directions selected for further consideration » 1. Find a way to eliminate, reduce, or prevent [the] (Ring is heavy) under the conditions of [the] (Ring is thick).	The following Operators can address any situation with contradictory requirements:		
» 4. Find an alternative way to obtain [the] (High mechanical strength) that offers the following: provides or enhances [the] (Containing fragments), does not require [the] (Ring is thick).	Separate opposite requirements in time Optimize characteristics in time Separate opposite requirements between the whole object and its parts		
4.1. Improve the useful factor (High mechanical strength).	Separate opposite requirements via changing conditions Separate an impeding part from an object Separate (remery) a required part from an object		
» 3. Try to resolve the following contradiction: The useful factor [the] (Ring is thick) should be in place in order to provide or enhance [the] (High mechanical strength), and should not exist in order to avoid [the] (Ring is heavy).			
3.1. Apply separation principles to satisfy contradictory requirements related to [the] (Ring is thick).			
3.2. Apply 40 Innovation Principles to resolve contradiction between useful purpose of (Ring is thick) and its harmful result.			

Operator: Separate opposite requirements in space

See ideas ## 5, 11,13,15: Ring with variable thickness, ribs; multi-layer ring.

Operator: Separate requirements in time

See idea # 10: Replace the ring with the airbag inflated by the impeller burst.

Operator: Separate opposite requirements between parts and the whole object

See idea # 1: Make the ring as an assembly from light parts that are easy to move for testing.

Operator: Separate requirements via changing conditions

9 Case study-Innovation WorkBench	
<u>F</u> ile <u>E</u> dit F <u>o</u> rmat ⊻iew <u>T</u> ools <u>D</u> iagram <u>W</u> indow <u>H</u> elp	
🗋 😂 🖬 🚭 🙏 🖻 🛍 🖤 📄 🚍 澤 澤 🏭 💭 🖉 🗶 😓 🔶	🔸 🥊 🚏 100% 🔽 Containment Ring
Prioritize Directions	Separate opposite requirements via changing
1. Directions selected for further consideration	conduons
» 1. Find a way to eliminate, reduce, or prevent [the] (Ring is heavy) under the conditions of [the] (Ring is thick).	If a system or process must satisfy contradictory requirements, perform contradictory functions, or operate under contradictory conditions, try to identify a parameter or
» 4. Find an alternative way to obtain [the] (High mechanical strength) that offers the following: provides or enhances [the] (Containing fragments), does not require [the] (Ring is thick).	condition that can change so the system can meet one requirement under one condition and the opposite requirement under another condition.
4.1. Improve the useful factor (High mechanical strength).	Illustrations: <u>Adjusting ski-to-snow contact</u>
» 3. Try to resolve the following contradiction: The useful factor [the] (Ring is thick) should be in place in order to provide or enhance [the] (High mechanical strength), and should not exist	 ▲<u>Alcohol-free wine</u> ▲<u>Cleansing parts before repair</u> ▲<u>Double-torch furnace</u>
in order to avoid [the] (Ring is heavy).	★ <u>Batch drying</u> ★ Silkworm cocoon treatment
3.1. Apply separation principles to satisfy contradictory requirements related to [the] (Ring is thick).	★ Using at two-sided photographic plate ★ Using ball hydraulics ★ Using the difference between electrical and sound propagation
3.2. Apply 40 Innovation Principles to resolve contradiction between useful purpose of (Ring is thick) and its harmful result.	See also: <u>Differential influence (separation)</u>

Idea # 19

Change the ring thickness or strength or other containing capabilities at the moment of impeller burst.

Direction 5.3: Increase effectiveness of the useful action of [the] (containing fragments)

Operator: Intensify a field

💡 Case study-Innovation WorkBench			
Eile Edit Format View Icols Diagram Window Help			
🗋 🖆 🖬 🚭 🕺 🖬 🛍 🏹 📄 菜 菜 菜 菜 菜 目 🔍 🗲 👰 🗶 🗢	🗲 🗣 🚏 100% 🔽 Containment Ring		
» 3. Try to resolve the following contradiction: The useful factor 🛋	Intensify a field		
[the] (Ring is thick) should be in place in order to provide or enhance [the] (High mechanical strength), and should not exist in order to avoid [the] (Ring is heavy).	Consider enhancing a system field by accumulating energy, then later releasing the energy.		
3.1. Apply separation principles to satisfy contradictory requirements related to [the] (Ring is thick).	Illustrations: ☆ <u>Automobile battery</u> ☆ <u>Filter cleaning</u>		
3.2. Apply 40 Innovation Principles to resolve contradiction between useful purpose of (Ring is thick) and its harmful result.	Husking of sufficience seeds Soliting imperfect crystals Soliting imperfect crystals Soliting imperfect crystals Soliting imperfect crystals		
» 5. Find an alternative way to obtain [the] (Containing fragments) that offers the following: eliminates, reduces, or prevents [the] (Fragments flying away), does not require [the] (High mechanical strength).	In particular, it is possible to enhance a system field by introducing additives.		
5.1. Improve the useful factor (Containing fragments).	Additives for field intensification		
5.2. Obtain the useful result without the use of [the] (Containing fragments).	Illustrations: ★ <u>Heating sheet metal prior to stamping</u> ★ <u>Manufacturing a plate of complex shape</u>		
5.3. Increase effectiveness of the useful action of [the] (Containing fragments).	It is also possible to enhance system functionality by using: <u>Devices for energy accumulation</u>		
5.4. Synthesize the new system to provide [the] (Containing	1		

Auxiliary Operator: Substances as energy accumulators

Idea # 20

Explode the ring in the moment of the impeller burst. Use the explosion wave to create a counteracting force.

Operator: Concentrate energy

Idea # 21

Disintegrate the fragments.

Idea # 22

Utilize special geometrical shapes to create traps for the fragments. For example, make the ring in the form of spring.

Operator: Introduce an additional field

Idea # 23

Create a combination of pressurized air and liquid to counteract fragments.

Operator: Substitute a field with a more effective one

😵 Case study-Innovation WorkBench Eile Edit Format View Tools Diagram Window Help				
 ○ ● ● ▲ ▲ ● ● ♥ ● ● ● ♥ ● ● ● ● ● ● ● ● ●	Image: Substitute a field with a more effective one A system function can be enhanced by replacing the field that produces the existing function with a more effective field. Illustrations:			
Cutting steel pipes with a directed explosion Cutting steel pipes with a directed explosion Cutting steel pipes with a directed explosion The methods conventionally used to cut steel pipes are labor-intensive, time-consuming, and inconvenient in extreme environments. (Some of these methods employ the use of gas or a single-point cutting tool.) A directed explosion can be used as an alternative cutting method. A metal pipe filled with an explosive material curved into a ring can be installed where the pipe is to be cut. This procedure ensures a simultaneous cut around the diameter of the pipe, and allows the cutting of any angle specified with respect to the pipe's longitudinal axis.	 Concentrating bio-suspensions Cutting steel pipes with a directed explosion Disinfecting transport facilities Fabricating a microwire capacitor Phased arrays Setting tires on wheels Sitkworm coccon treatment Using ultrasound to delay electronic signals For this purpose, use: Field transformation 			

See idea # 20: Counteracting explosion.

Operator: "Make a road"

<u>Idea # 24</u>

Create a safe pathway for fragments.

Idea # 25

Introduce strong fibers in the impeller blades that are capable to hold fragments after blades crash.

Direction 7a: Protect against fire or explosion

Operator: Introduce an insulating substance

Sease study-Innovation WorkBench File Edit Format View Tools Diagram Window Help					
 □ ☞ □ ● & h ● ♥ 目 = 目 年 年 日 » ≠ 型 ❷ ■ ← □ fragments). 	→ ♥ 100% Containment Ring Introduce an insulating substance				
5.5. Apply universal Operators to provide the useful factor (Containing fragments).	Consider isolating the source of harm by introducing an insulating material.				
5.6. Consider resources to provide the useful factor (Containing fragments).	 ▲ Fire protection in fuel tanks ▲ Using foam to contain blast fragments 				
Using foam to contain blast fragments When an old factory foundation was being demolished by explosion, there was a danger that blast fragments might damage nearby machine tools. To contain the fragments, the blast site was surrounded by plywood covered with foam.	See also: Isolator - inexpensive substance Isolator - modification of available substances Self-isolation If you are introducing an isolating material, you should introduce it as economically as possible and remove it as soon as the material has fulfilled its function. For this purpose, use: Smart" way to introduce a substance				

<u>Idea # 26</u>

Use foam or foam-like material to absorb energy. Apparently, we need special type of foam like metal foam. We can also consider other fillings that can absorb energy (asee also idea # 3).

Operator: Counteraction by means of a similar action

See idea # 20: Counteracting explosion.

Direction 7b: Reduce destruction

Second Study-Innovation WorkBench					
Eile Edit Format View Iools Diagram Window Help					
🗅 😂 🖬 🚭 从 🖻 🏨 🌾 臣 吾 甫 律 律 臣 » 乡 😨 碶 🐺 🔶 🔶 🕈 🌹 100% 🔽 Containment Ring					
fragments).					
5.5. Apply universal Operators to provide the useful factor (Containing fragments).	or destruction To eliminate or reduce deformation, displacement, shock, vibration or destruction, consider the following recommendations (Operators):				
 3.0. Consider resolutes to provide the userial factor (Containing fragments). 7. Find a way to eliminate, reduce, or prevent [the] (Impeller burst) in order to avoid [the] (Fragments flying away), under the conditions of [the] (Centrifugal forces pull parts of impeller) and (Impeller's material is not strong enough). 	Combine with another undesired action Counteraction by means of a similar action Anti-action Draw off an undesired action Local slackening of an action Slacken an action Mask defects				
2. List and categorize all preliminary ideas	Introduce an isolating substance				
Develop Concepts 1. Combine ideas into Concepts					
2. Apply Lines of Evolution to further improve Concepts					
Evaluate Results 1. Meet criteria for evaluating Concepts					

Operator: Counteraction by means of a similar action

See ideas ## 20, 21: counteracting explosion, disintegrating fragments

Operator: Anti-action

Consideration # 1

We can apply all ideas obtained for improving mechanical strength of the ring to the impeller blades.

Operator: Draw off an undesired action

See idea # 26: absorb the energy of fragments

Operator: Local slackening of an action

Security-Innovation WorkBench					
D G					
fragments).	▲ Local slackening of an action ▲				
5.5. Apply universal Operators to provide the useful factor (Containing fragments).	If it is impossible to eliminate a harmful effect (such as a destructive action or overheating, for example) consider reducing the effect at a specific place and/or for a specific				
5.6. Consider resources to provide the useful factor	period of time.				
(Containing fragments).	Also consider reducing the harmful effect by distributing or				
7. Find a way to eliminate, reduce, or prevent [the] (Impeller burst) in order to avoid [the] (Fragments flying away), under	diluting it (for instance, by diverting some of the energy that causes the effect).				
and (Impeller's material is not strong enough).	Illustration: ✿ <u>Equalizing sheave loading</u>				
2. List and categorize all preliminary ideas	If the harmful effect takes place at a point, consider changing the contact point to a line, surface, or volume contact. Consider as well the possibility of rolling contact.				
Develop Concepts					
1. Combine ideas into Concepts	Illustration: <u>A Plasma generator</u>				
2. Apply Lines of Evolution to further improve Concepts	Also try: In Rushing through				

<u>Idea # 27</u>

Define less dangerous directions and redirect fragments to these directions.

<u>Idea # 28</u>

Distributing the harmful energy between more fragments (see also ideas # 7 and 21: reducing energy /mass of fragments)

Operator: Slacken an action (Weaken an undesired action by prolonging it)

<u>Idea # 29</u>

Create a special pathway (spiral) to trap the fragments and to reduce their energy while traveling through the spiral route (see ideas ## 22 and 24). Also, see idea # 26: absorb the energy.

Direction15.1: Improve the useful factor (Test convenience)¹

Operator: Make an object dismountable

See idea # 1: Make the ring as an assembly from light parts that are easy to move for testing.

¹ This direction has been addressed in a limited fashion as we do not have detail information about the test procedure.

Operator: Apply disposable objects

Idea # 30

Disposable ring – consider that the ring will be destroyed while absorbing all the energy of the fragments (similar to idea # 3).

Operator: Move a heavy object

<u>Idea # 31</u>

Consider various types of support while transporting the ring.

Operator: "Retain the available"

Idea # 32

Learn in detail the process of transportation and look for the ways to reduce the number of liftings of the ring.

List and categorize all preliminary ideas

Idea # 1: Make the ring as an assembly made of light-weight parts that are easy to move for testing purposes.

Idea # 2: Provide high airflow with low rotational speed of the fan. Perhaps utilize several slow fans instead of one that rotates quickly.

Idea # 3: Utilize a "weak" ring that will absorb energy as it is destroyed.

Idea # 4: Perform testing without removing the ring.

Idea # 5: Reduce the mass of the fragments to reduce damage.

Idea # 6: Vary the thickness of the ring tube, reducing the thickness where permissible.

Idea # 7: Introduce preliminary stress. For example, use additional rings which have been pressure-fitted to create a force directed toward the inside of the ring.

Idea # 8: Use thermal treatment to harden the ring material.

Idea # 9: Use special reinforcing threads (fibers) such as those found in bullet-proof vests.

Idea # 10: Replace the ring with an airbag that inflates when the impeller bursts.

Idea # 11. Make a thin ring that has reinforcing ribs. If the ribs are placed on the internal surface of the ring, flying fragments will lose much of their energy smashing into the ribs.

Idea # 12: Make the ring corrugated in two planes.

Idea # 13: Determine where the ring usually breaks and reinforce those places.

Idea # 14: Internal ribs with sharp edges can counteract flying fragments, breaking them into smaller pieces.

Idea # 15: Use a multi-layer ring: additional strengthening rings, rings having different hardness and elasticity, rings which have a gap in between them, filling the gap with an energy-absorbing material.

Idea # 16: Make the ring out of separate layers so that if cracks develop inside they will not spread.

Idea # 17: Use metal-concrete or some other composite material.

Idea # 18: Create inner stresses inside the ring: This can be done using wiring, banding, double ring structure, etc.

Idea # 19. Change the ring thickness or strength or other containment capabilities the moment the impeller bursts.

Idea # 20. Explode the ring the moment the impeller bursts. Use the explosion wave to create a counteracting force.

Idea # 21. Disintegrate the fragments.

Idea # 22. Utilize special geometrical shapes to create traps for the fragments. For example, make the ring in the form of spring.

Idea # 23. Create a combination of pressurized air and liquid to counteract the fragments.

Idea # 24: Create a safe pathway for the fragments.

Idea # 25. Introduce strong fibers in the impeller blades that are capable of holding the fragments after the impeller bursts.

Idea # 26. Use foam or foam-like material to absorb energy. Apparently, we need a special type of foam such as metal foam. We can also consider other fillings that can absorb energy (see idea # 3).

Idea # 27. Define the least dangerous directions and redirect the fragments in these directions.

Idea # 28. Distribute the harmful energy between more of the fragments (see also ideas # 7 and 21: reducing energy/mass of the fragments).

Idea # 29. Create a special pathway (spiral) to trap the fragments and to reduce their energy while traveling through the spiral route (see ideas # 22 and 24). Also, see idea # 26: absorb the energy.

Idea # 30. Disposable ring – consider that the ring will be destroyed while absorbing all the energy of the fragments (similar to idea # 3).

Idea # 31. Consider various types of support while transporting the ring.

Idea # 32. Learn the details of the transporting process and look for the ways to reduce the number of liftings.

We can categorized the obtained ideas into the following groups:

1. Strengthening the ring via

a) changing the ring material structure:

- creating inner stresses (wiring, banding, press-fit) (#18, 7)
- introducing special reinforcing threads (fibers), using metal-concrete or other composite materials (# 9, 17, 25)
- special thermal treatment for hardening the ring material (# 8)
- using a multi-layer ring with layers with different properties (elasticity, hardness, gaps filled with energy-absorbing materials) (# 15)

b) changing the ring's shape:

- vary the ring thickness to best accommodate the situation (# 6,13)
- create various reinforcing ribs (# 11)
- use two-plane corrugations (# 12)

2. Increasing the ring's energy-absorbing properties via

a) changing the material structure:

- using foam and/or foam-like materials (metal foam, honeycomb, wiring, brushes) (#3, 23, 26, 30)
- using a multi-layer ring with layers capable of moving relative to one another to absorb extra energy

b) changing the ring's shape:

• spiral or other traps that can slow down the fragments (#22)

3. Reducing the mass/energy of the flying fragments to reduce damage and allow the ring's mechanical strength to be lowered via

- changing the ring's material structure to make it capable of breaking into smaller pieces (# 5, 21,28)
- introduce ribs with sharp edges capable of breaking fragments into smaller pieces (# 11,14)

4. Improve testing convenience, including:

- perform the test without removing the ring (# 4)
- make the ring dismountable and transport parts of the ring rather than the whole thing (# 1)
- consider various types of special support during ring transport (# 31)

- 5. Strengthen the impeller blades to eliminate the need for the ring (#25)
- 6. Define or create a safe pathway for the fragments (# 24, 27, 29)
- 7. Change the principle of operation of the ring, including:
- replace the ring with an airbag that inflates the moment the impeller bursts (# 10) or change its thickness (# 19)
- explode the ring to create a counteracting force (# 20) and/or break the fragments into smaller pieces
- 8. Replace the impeller with a safer method of providing air (# 2)

Develop Concepts

Combine ideas into Concepts

Combine ideas that perform the same function in different ways

Step 1. Select two ideas that resolve the same sub-problem in different ways.

Idea # 17 (Use metal concrete or other composite materials) and idea # 11 (make a thin ring with reinforcing ribs) provide the same function (strengthening) in different ways – changing structure (#17) and changing shape (# 11).

Step 2. Compare these ideas; each has its own advantages.

Idea # 11 is preferable from the main function point of view because it can provide greater strength. However, it is not easy to make ribs from the steel. The advantage of idea # 17 is that composite materials are easy to shape.

Step 3. Consider the idea that has better functional features as the "source of resources"; the other idea is the "recipient of resources."

We select idea # 11 as the "source of resources"

Idea # 17 is the "recipient of resources"

Step 4. Determine the elements that provide better functionality of the "source" idea.

The element providing better functionality is a steel tube.

Steps 5-7. Apply these elements to the "recipient."

We can combine two ideas having a steel tube with ribs made from a composite material.

Apply Lines of Evolution to further improve your Concepts

Sease study-Innovation WorkBench File Edit Format View Tools Diagram Window Help						
D 🔗 🖶 🚭 🙏 🖻 🛍 🍼 📄 홈 掌 掌 듣 🕨 🖋 📮 및 목 🗢 → 🔮 🎔 100% ▼ Containment Ring 🔹						
15.6. Apply universal Operators to provide the useful factor (Test convenience).	Apply the Lines of Evolution					
15.7. Consider resources to provide the useful factor (Test convenience).	of Evolution.					
2. List and categorize all preliminary ideas	document strong, historically-recurring tendencies in the development of man-made and natural systems. A Pattern usually contains Lines of Evolution that describe in greater detail trainal					
Develop Concepts 1. Combine ideas into Concepts	contains Lines of Evolution that describe in greater detail typical sequences of the stages (positions on a Line) that a system follows in the process of its natural evolution. Once these positions are known the system's current position(s) on a line can					
2. Apply Lines of Evolution to further improve Concepts	be identified, and the possibility of transitioning to the next position (s) can be assessed. In some situations it may be obvious how this transition should be made. In other cases it will be helpful to apply the following recommendations, called Operators/I ines :					
Evaluate Results 1. Meet criteria for evaluating Concepts	Increasing ideality Building bi- and poly-systems					
2. Reveal and prevent potential failures	Developing a substance's structure Dynamization					
3. Plan the implementation	Increasing controllability Element universalization					

A substantial number of the obtained ideas have already included features recommended by most of the patterns/lines above. For example, the idea of a multi-layer ring is in accordance with the patterns Building bi-and poly-systems and Segmentation; the idea of using composite materials fits the pattern Developing a substance's structure; ideas related to replacing the ring with an airbag or exploding the ring fit the pattern of Dynamization. It might still be interesting, however, to consider the set of Operators/Lines entitled Increasing controllability.

Operator: Introduce an additive to increase process controllability

Operator: Introduce a controlled section

Operator: Self-control

The Operators above allow us to further develop idea # 20 (explosive ring). A controlled section (detonator) and additives (explosives) should be placed in the light tube. The first fragment that will reach the tube will activate the detonator (self-control).

Evaluate Results

Meet criteria for evaluating Concepts

🔮 Case study-Innovation WorkBench 🔤 🔲 🐨 🔀 🔍 💼 🗙					
Eile <u>E</u> dit F <u>o</u> rmat <u>V</u> iew <u>T</u> ools <u>D</u> iagram <u>W</u> indow <u>H</u> elp					
🗅 🚰 🖶 🚳 糸 ங 🍓 🖤 圭 喜 理 律 律 三 » 🖋 🖓 碶 碶 🔍 🗢 > 🕈 🏴 100% 🔍 Containment Ring					
	Meet criteria for evaluating Concepts				
Develop Concepts 1. Combine ideas into Concepts	If the Concept does not meet certain criteria or violates one or more limitations, do not abandon it! Instead, think of each of these criteria or limitations as a secondary problem that should be solved				
2. Apply Lines of Evolution to further improve Concepts	To address a secondary problem, select <u>Working with</u>				
Evaluate Results					
1. Meet criteria for evaluating Concepts					
2. Reveal and prevent potential failures					
3. Plan the implementation					

The following ideas were selected:

For short-term: Multi-layer ring; ring with ribs.

For mid-term: Explosive ring.

For long-term: Blades with fibers (wire) inside to keep pieces in place.

The short-term idea of utilizing a multi-layer ring creates a secondary problem – the increased cost associated with manufacturing the different layers and with the final assembly of the ring. We therefore have a secondary problem – reduce cost.

💡 Case study-Innovation WorkBench						
Elle Edit Format View Tools Diagram Window Help						
🗅 😅 🖬 🚭 🗼 🎕 籠 🖤 監 客 理 倖 倖 듣 » 🗲 🖾 @ 興 👰 😓 🔷 🖤 🖤 100% 🔽 Containment Ring						
Back Reduce cost						
Develop Concepts	-	To reduce cost, consider the following recommendations				
1. Combine ideas into Concepts	((Operators):				
2. Apply Lines of Evolution to further improve Concepts		Apply disposable objects Apply a model (copy)				
Evaluate Results 1. Meet criteria for evaluating Concepts		■ Reduce energy consumption ■ Idealization				
2. Reveal and prevent potential failures						
3. Plan the implementation						

Idealization

🔋 Case study-Innovation WorkBench						
File Edit Format View Tools Diagram Window Help						
□ 물 불 행 총 地 팀 ◇ 臣 宇 君 好 好 :: : >> > / [인 뫶!♥! ♥ >> >> >> >> ? ? !! Containment Ring						
Develop Concepts		Idealization is a process that targets the ideal system, that is, a				
1. Combine ideas into Concepts		system that performs a required function without actually existing. Idealization allows you to approach the ideal situation as closely as				
2. Apply Lines of Evolution to further improve		possible given the available resources and imposed limitations.				
Concepts	To make your system more ideal, consider the following recommendations (Operators):					
Evaluate Results		🖉 Evoludo duplicato elemento				
1. Meet criteria for evaluating Concepts		Lise more highly integrated subsystems				
2. Reveal and prevent potential failures		Exclude auxiliary functions Self-service Exclude elements				
3. Plan the implementation		Consolidation of discrete subsystems Simplify through total replacement				

Exclude auxiliary functions

💡 Case study-Innovation WorkBench						
Eile Edit Format ⊻iew Tools Diagram Window Help						
🗅 🏕 🖬 🚭 糸 ங 🏝 🌾 監 丟 酒 倖 痺 圧 » 🗲 🐺 🐺 🐺 🐺 🗣 🖤 100% 💎 Containment Ring						
Exclude auxiliary functions						
Develop Concepts	Auxiliary functions provide support and/or contribute to execution					
1. Combine ideas into Concepts	of the system's main (primary) function(s). In many situations auxiliary functions can be excluded (together with the elements					
2. Apply Lines of Evolution to further improve	and/or parts associated with their performance) without deteriorating the performance of the main function(s).					
Concepts	To find a way to exclude an auxiliary function, consider the					
Evaluate Results	following recommendations (Operators):					
1. Meet criteria for evaluating Concepts	Concepts Exclude correcting functions Exclude preliminary functions failures Exclude protective functions Exclude protective functions					
2. Reveal and prevent potential failures						
3. Plan the implementation	Exclude other auxiliary functions					
	For measurement/control systems, also see:					

Operator: Exclude preliminary operations (functions)

<u>Idea # 33</u>

Instead of manufacturing several layers and assembling them later, use surface hardening of the internal and external surfaces of the ring. Hardening the inner surface will allow the ring to better counteract the fragments. Hardening the outer surface can create additional inner stresses that in turn increase the ring's overall strength. Together, these measures should allow the weight of the ring to be reduced without sacrificing its containment capabilities.

Reveal and prevent potential failures

<mark>응 Case study-Innovation WorkBench</mark> 변환 전에 이 또 가지 않는 것이 있는 것이 없는 것이 없는 것이 없는 것이 없는 것이 있는 것이 없는 것이 없 것이 없는 것이 없다. 것이 없는 것이 없다. 것이 없는 것이 없는 것이 없는 것이 없는 것이 없는 것이 없다. 것이 없는 것이 없는 것이 없는 것이 없는 것이 없는 것이 없다. 것이 없는 것이 없 않이 않이 않이 않이 않이						
D 😂 🖬 🚳 🐰 🗈 ப 🖏 👘 🗮 🌮 王 幸 幸 幸 臣 » 🦻 / 🐺 🐺 🐺 🖓 🖓 🖓 🖓 🗘 < → 🕈 🖤 100% 🔍 Containment Ring						
Reveal and prevent potential failures						
Develop Concepts 1. Combine ideas into Concepts	Instead of brainstorming about what non-obvious failures might occur, in I-TRIZ you "invent" possible failures – then find ways to prevent or eliminate them. For this purpose, formulate the problem of invention the failure using the following template:					
2. Apply Lines of Evolution to further improve Concepts	There is a Concept called [Concept name and brief description] for [Purpose for implementing the Concept]. It is necessary to					
Evaluate Results 1. Meet criteria for evaluating Concepts	the implementation of this Concept.					
2. Reveal and prevent potential failures	Then follow these steps: Describe each stage of Concept implementation. Describe the possible failures of each stage.					
3. Plan the implementation	 List all obvious ways to "accomplish" each failure. Consider <u>weak and dangerous zones</u> as resources for potential failures. Consider <u>possible failures of devices, objects, etc.</u> Consider <u>possible harmful impacts</u> on each stage of implementation. Consider <u>potentially dangerous moments/periods of time</u> during implementation. Consider measures for preventing the failures you have revealed. 					

7. Consider potentially dangerous moments/periods of time during implementation.

💡 Case study-Innovation WorkBench					
<u>F</u> ile <u>E</u> dit F <u>o</u> rmat <u>V</u> iew <u>T</u> ools <u>D</u> iagram <u>W</u> indow <u>H</u> elp					
D 😂 🖬 🚭 3, ங ஸ. 🌾 註 菩 酒 倖 倖 汪 » 乡 🖓 🖓 📮 🗢 → ♥ 🖤 100% 💌 Containment Ring					
	Potentially dangerous moments/periods of time				
Develop Concepts 1. Combine ideas into Concepts	Consider the following as potential resources for failure during any				
2. Apply Lines of Evolution to further improve Concepts	Periods of disturbance in an otherwise monotonous operation/process				
Evaluate Results 1. Meet criteria for evaluating Concepts	Periods of high general stress Periods of high personal stress Periods of high personal stress Periods following a catastrophe, failure, etc.				
2. Reveal and prevent potential failures	Test periods, etc.				
3. Plan the implementation					

<u>Idea # 34</u>

According to the checklist, testing the ring can be dangerous itself – for example, reducing the ring's strength can later produce a ring failure. To avoid this problem, it might be preferable to replace the current test procedure with one that utilizes ultrasound, acoustic emission or other "intro-vision" technologies.

Plan the implementation

The following ideas were suggested for testing:

For the short-term: Ring with hardened surfaces; ring with ribs.

For the mid-term: Explosive ring.

For the long-term: Blades with fibers (wire) inside to keep the fragments in place.

Summary

Category	Tool utilized				
	Contradictio n Table	Ideation Improver	Ideation IWB	IMC Tech Optimizer ²	
Number of Directions	3	6	18		
(problem statements) offered					
Number of recommendations	11	44	>100 +		
(Operators) offered			>10 groups		
Number of ideas obtained	6	19	34		

 $[\]overline{^2$ The column will be filled out in the next issue.